

APPENDIX D
ACEC ANALYSIS

Appendix D - Evaluation of Proposed Ivanpah Valley ACEC in California

General Location:	Northeastern San Bernardino County
General Description:	Portion of Ivanpah Valley located in California
Nominated By:	Basin and Range Watch.
Nominated Acreage:	32,000 public land acres.
Values Considered:	Cultural, Visual, and Biological Resources

Relevance

In accordance with BLM ACEC Manual 1613, an area meets the “relevance” criterion if it contains one or more of the following:

Relevance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
A significant historic, cultural, or scenic value (including rare or sensitive archeological resources and religious or cultural resources important to Native Americans).	No	The overall area in both CA and NV was nominated for this value. However, the nomination was based on Class I and Class II areas, which are not relevant to the Ivanpah Valley. The area, designated as Primm Valley Unit 09 in the BLM Needles Field Office Visual Resource Inventory (BLM 2010), is classified as Visual Resource Inventory Class III (Table 5-1 in BLM 2010). The adjacent area from which the valley is visible (Clark Mountain, Unit 08) is also classified as Visual Resource Inventory Class III.
	No	The area was nominated for this value, and generally discusses some potential archeological resources within the area. However, none of these resources have been determined to be rare or sensitive, or to be religious or cultural resources important to Native Americans.
A fish and wildlife resource (including habitat for endangered, sensitive or threatened species, or habitat essential for maintaining species diversity).	Yes	Desert tortoise (<i>Gopherus agassizii</i>)—Federally listed (Threatened). This area does not contain designated critical habitat, but the area includes known and modeled habitat, as well as habitat that is likely to support tortoise. West of I-15 contains moderate density habitat, including an artificially high population in the large scale translocation site.
	Yes	Gila Monster (<i>Heloderma suspectum</i>)—BLM sensitive. Habitat present, never observed.
	Yes	Desert bighorn sheep (<i>Ovis canadensis nelson</i>)—BLM sensitive. Present in the Lucy Gray Mountains, which is within the nomination area.
	Yes	Western burrowing owl (<i>Athene cunicularia</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes year round habitat, but the species has not been observed in this area.
	Yes	Golden eagle (<i>Aquila chrysaetos</i>)—BLM sensitive. Habitat is present, birds observed in McCollough Mountains to the east of the nomination.
	Yes	Loggerhead shrike (<i>Lanus ludovicianus</i>)—BLM sensitive. Habitat is present and birds have been observed in this area.
	Yes	Le Conte's thrasher (<i>Toxostoma lecontei</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes year round habitat.
	Yes	Brewer's sparrow (<i>Spizella breweri</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes summer habitat.

Relevance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
	Yes	Ferruginous hawk (<i>Buteo regalis</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes winter habitat.
	Yes	Peregrine falcon (<i>Falco peregrines</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes habitat.
	Yes	Lewis's woodpecker (<i>Melanerpes lewis</i>)—BLM sensitive. Area includes migration and winter habitat.
	Yes	Other CDFG SSC bird species nominated: Mountain Plover (<i>Charadrius montanus</i>), Northern harrier (<i>Circus cyaneus</i>), Northern Goshawk (<i>Accipiter gentilis</i>), Long-eared Owl (<i>Asio otus</i>), Short-eared Owl (<i>Asio flammeus</i>), Black Swift (<i>Cypseloides niger</i>), Lucy's Warbler (<i>Oreothlypis luciae</i>), Yellow Warbler (<i>Dendroica petechia</i>), Whip-poor-will (<i>Caprimulgus vociferus</i>), Costa's Hummingbird (<i>Calypte costae</i>), Calliope Hummingbird (<i>Stellula calliope</i>), Williamson's Sapsucker (<i>Sphyrapicus thyroideus</i>), Willow Flycatcher (<i>Empidonax traillii</i>), Sage Thrasher (<i>Oreoscoptes montanus</i>), Cactus Wren (<i>Campylorhynchus brunneicapillus</i>). Both habitat and species potentially present.
	Yes	California sensitive vegetation species nominated: Nevada agave (<i>Agave utahensis</i> var. <i>nevadensis</i>), Wright's beebrush (<i>Aloysia wrightii</i>), small-flowered androstephium (<i>Androstephium breviflorum</i>), desert bearpoppy (<i>Arctomecon merriamii</i>) Mojave milkweed (<i>Asclepias nyctaginifolia</i>), borrego milkvetch (<i>Astragalus lentiginosus</i> var. <i>borreganus</i>), Tidestrom's milkvetch (<i>Astragalus tidestromii</i>), Chihuahua scaly cloakfern (<i>Astrolepis cochisensis</i> ssp. <i>cochisensis</i>), black grama (<i>Bouteloua eriopoda</i>), red grama (<i>Bouteloua trifida</i>), revolute spurge (<i>Chamaesyce revolute</i>), purple bird's beak (<i>Cordylanthus parviflorus</i>), desert pincushion (<i>Corypantha chlorantha</i>), Gilman's springparsley (<i>Cymopterus gilmanii</i>), Utah vine milkweed (<i>Cynanchum utahensis</i>), nine-awned pappus grass (<i>Enneapogon desvauxii</i>), Utah fleabane (<i>Erigeron utahensis</i>), hairy woollygrass (<i>Erioneuron pilosum</i>), Clark Mountain spurge (<i>Euphorbia exstipulata</i> var. <i>exstipulata</i>), limestone bedstraw (<i>Galium proliferum</i>), parish's club-cholla (<i>Grusonia parishii</i>), California false pennyroyal (<i>Hedeoma nanum</i> var. <i>californicum</i>), polished blazingstar (<i>Mentzelia polita</i>), wingseed blazingstar (<i>Mentzelia pterosperma</i>), Utah mortonia (<i>Mortonia utahensis</i>), crowned muilla (<i>Muilla coronata</i>), cavedwelling evening primrose (<i>Oenothera cavernae</i>), pinto beardtongue (<i>Penstemon bicolor</i> ssp. <i>roseus</i>), Aven Nelson's phacelia (<i>Phacelia anelsonii</i>), skyblue phacelia (<i>Phacelia coerulea</i>), Goodding's phacelia (<i>Phacelia pulchella</i> var. <i>gooddingii</i>), Chinese lantern (<i>Physalis lobata</i>), desert portulaca (<i>Portulaca halimoides</i>), Abert's sanvitalia (<i>Sanvitalia abertii</i>), Rusby's desert-mallow (<i>Sphaeralcea rusbyi</i> var. <i>eremicola</i>), Branched noseburn (<i>Tragia ramosa</i>). Both habitat and species present.
A natural process or system (including endangered, sensitive, or threatened plant species; rare, endemic, or relic plants or plant communities that are terrestrial, aquatic, or riparian; or rare geological features).	Yes	Biological Soil Crusts—Present in the Ivanpah Valley.

Relevance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
Natural hazards (including areas of avalanche, dangerous flooding, landslides, unstable soils, seismic activity, or dangerous if it is determined through the resource management planning process that it has become part of a natural process).	No	Not nominated for this value.

Importance

In accordance with BLM ACEC Manual 1613, the value, resource, system, process, or hazard described above must have substantial significance and values to satisfy the “importance” criteria. This generally means that the value, resource, system, process, or hazard is characterized by one or more of the following:

Importance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
Has more than locally significant qualities that give it special worth, consequence, meaning, distinctiveness, or cause for concern, especially compared with any similar resource.	Yes	Desert tortoise— This area was not originally included in the Ivanpah DWMA because it was relatively small, was separated from other desert tortoise populations in the NEMO Planning Area by I-15 and Ivanpah Dry Lake, and was undergoing substantial development pressures particularly adjacent to I-15. Despite the relatively small, fragmented nature of this area, new information is available which supports establishing additional protections to allow the desert tortoise to persist in the western portion of Ivanpah Valley.
	No	Gila Monster—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Desert bighorn sheep—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Western burrowing owl—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Golden eagle—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Loggerhead shrike—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Le Conte’s thrasher—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Brewer’s sparrow—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Ferruginous hawk—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.

Importance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
	No	Peregrine falcon—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Lewis's woodpecker—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Other CDFG SSC bird species (listed above) are not found only in this area and are considered common species by the BLM. Not more than locally significant.
	No	Other California sensitive vegetation species (listed above) are not found only in this area and are considered common species by the BLM. Not more than locally significant.
	No	Biological Soil Crusts are not found only in this area. Not more than locally significant.
Has qualities or circumstances that make it fragile, sensitive, rare, irreplaceable, exemplary, unique, endangered, threatened, or vulnerable to adverse change.	Yes	Desert tortoise—Development pressure on this area has increased substantially. Development was originally anticipated to occur along I-15, which would have left large tracts of the valley undisturbed and enabled the valley to continue to support a viable desert tortoise population, despite the fragmentation issues. The increase in renewable energy development pressure in Ivanpah Valley is such that if the appropriate protections are not put into place, the remaining habitat may no longer be able to support the resident desert tortoise population. There is more connectivity than originally thought. As a result, movement between this population and other populations may be possible across I-15 via culverts and across the Stateline Wilderness area into Mesquite Valley. As such, this area may not be as isolated as described in the 2002 NEMO Plan and this population may play a more important role in the greater meta-population than previously anticipated.
	No	Gila Monster—There is potential habitat throughout the region. The habitat in this area is not more than locally significant.
	No	Desert bighorn sheep—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Western burrowing owl—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Golden eagle—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Loggerhead shrike—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Le Conte's thrasher—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Brewer's sparrow—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.

Importance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
	No	Ferruginous hawk—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Peregrine falcon—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Lewis's woodpecker—The species and habitat is found throughout the entire west. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Other CDFG SSC bird species (listed above) have habitat that is not limited to Ivanpah Valley. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Other California sensitive vegetation species (listed above) are considered regional endemic plants. For some of the nominated species the majority of known distribution is outside of the Ivanpah Valley.
	No	While there are intact soil crusts, there are other areas that are less disturbed. The nomination did not provide specific information to support an assertion that the biological soil crusts in Ivanpah Valley are unique, special, or of such high quality that they merit the creation of an ACEC.
Has been recognized as warranting protection to satisfy national priority concerns or to carry out the mandates of FLPMA.	No	Desert tortoise—While the species is Federally listed, there is no designated critical habitat in the area. While the species receives protection from the Endangered Species Act, the absence of designated critical habitat shows this area has not been specifically recognized as warranting protection.
	No	Gila Monster—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Desert bighorn sheep—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Western burrowing owl—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Golden eagle—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority. While there is a Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act, this act does not require that this part of the habitat for golden eagle be a national priority.
	No	Loggerhead shrike—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Le Conte's thrasher—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Brewer's sparrow—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Ferruginous hawk—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Peregrine falcon—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.
	No	Lewis's woodpecker—BLM sensitive species for the State of Nevada, not a national priority.

Importance Value	Yes/No	Rationale for Determination
	No	Other CDFG SSC bird species (listed above) have habitat that is not limited to Ivanpah Valley. The habitat in the nominated area is not more exemplary or unique than other habitats.
	No	Other California sensitive vegetation species (listed above) are considered regional endemic plants. For some of the nominated species the majority of known distribution is outside of the Ivanpah Valley.
	No	While there are intact soil crusts, there are other areas that are less disturbed. The nomination did not provide specific information to support an assertion that the biological soil crusts in Ivanpah Valley are unique, special, or of such high quality that they merit the creation of an ACEC.
Has qualities that warrant highlighting to satisfy public or management concerns about safety and public welfare.	No	Area was not nominated for this value. None known to be present.
Poses a significant threat to human life and safety or to property.	No	Area was not nominated for this value. Not present.

Nominated Area to Potential ACEC

This area was nominated to include 32,000 acres of public land in California. Basin and Range Watch identified this area as being important for several sensitive species. Their nomination states, "The Ivanpah Valley contains an important habitat that supports a variety of rare and important species as well as important visual and cultural resources. The Ivanpah Valley is also undergoing pressure to develop various land uses. Golden Eagle, Western Burrowing Owl, Peregrine Falcon, chuckwalla and Gila monster occur here, as well as many rare plants from Nevada and California."

BLM acknowledges the value of many of the resources nominated, and many of the current ACECs and proposed ACECs contain these resources and will provide adequate protection. In addition, the RMP contains objectives and minimization measures to provide protection for these resources outside designated areas. The BLM interdisciplinary team determined that the area does not meet the criteria of relevance and importance for visual or cultural values, many fish and wildlife resources, or natural processes or systems.

The BLM determined that the area meets criteria for both relevance and importance for the desert tortoise, and will be considered in the Draft EIS.